



A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF JOB SATISFACTION AMONG PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR INDUSTRIAL UNITS OF KUMAUN DIVISION OF UTTARAKHAND

Manisha Sharma

MBA, M.Com., Phd., Kashipur (Uttarakhand)

Received : 29/09/2017

1st BPR : 30/09 /2017

2nd BPR : 11/10 /2017

Accepted : 22/10/2017

ABSTRACT

Organizational structure plays an important role in the efficient running of some business enterprise. There is relationship between organizational structure and degree of job satisfaction. There are many types and patterns of organizational structure. In the paper only one dimension of organizational structure i.e., ownership has been taken to judge its impact on job satisfaction and a comparative study of job satisfaction among private and public sector industrial units of Kumaun Division of Uttarakhand has been made.

Key words: organizational, satisfaction, dimension, comparative, contextual.

Introduction

Design of organizational structure is considered to be a matter of choice among a large number of alternatives¹. There are various forms of organizational structure; however, not all of them are suitable for all situations because of the differences in contextual variables which affect the organizational structure. From this point of view, managers must be aware of the various alternatives, so that they are able to choose a suitable structure for their organizations. The classification of organizational structure is based on the way various activities are grouped together to create departments and units and prescribing their relationships in the organization. Thus, there are seven types of organizational structures - line, line & staff, functional, divisional, project, matrix, and free form. Each of these emphasizes different arrangement of organizational activities. Some of these are designed on mechanistic pattern and some are designed on organic or dynamic pattern. Others have a combination of both mechanistic and organic patterns in varying degrees. Further, some of the structures are basic; some emerge because of overlays which denote super imposition of one element over another. Besides the basic organizational structure, organizations may create committees taking personnel from different departments where the processes are quite different as compared to a department.²

Henry Mintzberg has given a different scheme of classification of organizational structures. Rather than focusing on structural imperatives, people, or rules, his description of structure emphasizes the ways activities are coordinated. Accordingly, there are five types of structures - simple structure, machine bureaucracy, professional bureaucracy, divisionalized, and adhocracy³. In each structure, arrangement of activities and, therefore, coordination mechanism differs.

Workers' attitude and behavior are shaped, to a great extent, by the organizational structure. There are several evidences which have shown relationship between organizational structure and variations in the behavior and attitude of the industrial workers. In this study only one organizational dimension namely, ownership i.e., private or public has been presented and analyzed. On the bases of ownership, the industrial units of Kumaun Division of Uttarakhand constitute 92 percent part while public sector



including cooperative sector constitutes merely 8 percent of the total industrial units of all scales established in the Kumaun Division.

Objectives of the Study

The chief objective of the study is to find relationship between pattern of ownership and degree of job satisfaction among the workers. The subsidiary objective of the study is to compare the level of job satisfaction between private and public sector workers.

Research Design and Methodology

Presently there are 106 large, 92 medium scale and 4860 small scale industrial units in Kumaun Division of Uttarakhand. On the basis of size determined by the number of workers working in these industrial units, the units under study have been categorized into three groups:-

- (i) Large Size - employing more than 100 workers;
- (ii) Medium Size - employing between 50 - 100 workers;
- (iii) Small Size - employing less than 50 workers.

As number of units is large, the units selected through stratified random sampling method are as under:-

Large Size	: 8
Medium Size	: 20
Small Size	: 20

The numbers of workers have been chosen through stratified and random sampling. As 20, 10 and 5 workers from each industrial unit respectively have been selected. In this way, the total number of randomly selected workers is given in the following table:

Table 01
Selection of Industrial Workers

Size of the Industrial Unit	No. of Workers Selected	Percentage to Total Workers
Large Size	160	34.78
Medium Size	200	43.48
Small Size	100	21.74
Total	460	100.00

Sources : Based on Industrial Units Selected

Analysis of Data

The sector wise position of industrial workers has been as under :

Table 02

Name of Sector	No. of Workers Selected	Percentage to Total Workers
Private Sector	420	91.30
Public Sector	20	8.70
Total	460	100.00

Source : Based on Survey

The above data show that the private sector is in dominant position in Kumaun Division as far as industrialization is concerned. In the modern times of liberalization, globalization and privatization Government hand in trade and industry is not considered feasible. Sinha (1973) Comparing the efficiency



in two types of organizations (private and public sector) notes that the lack of commitment (nobody is at loss if Government goes in loss), indiscipline among the workers, absence of reward for work etc., are some of the important reasons for low efficiency in public sector organizations. Moreover, "private sector industries have promoted a climate which is more conducive to chances of promotion, efficiency, responsibility, better social relations, initiative and reward and better working conditions. In brief it may be put that the private sector has got better organizational climate with sharper demands and higher hopes of reward although the possibility of the effect of response set cannot completely be ruled out. The public sector industries on the other hand seem to be lagging behind on all these matters" (Sinha, 1973).

The cooperative industries which are very small in number have the same features as the public sector industries do have, so the distinction between these two types of organizations is very difficult to be pointed out. The main reason of this similarity from workers' point of view is that the wage-structure, salary-structure and terms & conditions are alike that of Government employees and these organization are under the Government control directly and indirectly both.

As a result of control and regulation by several labour and industrial laws, the private and public sector industrial units have standardized service conditions. Still some features are lacking in one or the other. The characteristic like security of job which can be seen in public sector organizations, is seen in a lesser measure in private sector undertakings. On the other hand it is presumed that certain other characteristics like advancement linked to performance rather than to seniority greatly observed in private sector enterprises is seen in a lesser measure in public sector organizations. Lahire (1965) also notes differences between the Government and non-Government employees in attaching importance of job factors. These observations are true in many respects to private and public sector industrial workers also. Thus, it has been hypothesized that workers of private sector industrial units would be more satisfied with their jobs than their counterparts in the public sector industrial units.

In order to test this hypothesis, the job satisfaction of both sets of workers have been measured and the job satisfaction scores thus obtained have been presented in the following table :

Table 03

Job Satisfaction Scores of Private Sector and Public Sector Industries

Job Satisfaction Scores	Private Sector Industries	Public Sector Industries
51-60	8	1
61-70	4	2
71-80	38	2
81-90	23	8
91-100	40	9
101-110	80	8
111-120	105	5
121-130	97	4
131-140	25	0
141-150	0	1

N =	420	40
Mean =	108.31	98.75
SD =	18.41	18.36
Z =	6.184	> 2.58 (1%)

Table 3 reveals differences in job satisfaction of the industrial workers of the private and public sector industrial units very clearly. The mean job satisfaction score of private sector workers is much higher



(108.31) as compared to that of the public sector industrial workers (98.75). The Z value is 6.184 which is significant at .01 level. The finding confirms our hypothesis, and is also supported by Veeraghvan (1960) who noted that "in general private sector employees displayed greater satisfaction and were favorably disposed towards the management."

The point needs further elaboration. On the whole, it was noted that the work environment of the private sector units revealed a much better and congenial atmosphere. The workers of different categories have more favorable attitude towards each other. However, the data are further analyzed to compare the job satisfaction of the workers of various categories i.e. skilled, semi-skilled and unskilled in the two types of organizations. They were regrouped into two categories of dissatisfied and satisfied workers to see the differences if any. For this median value has calculated which came to be 100. Thus, the dissatisfied group consisted of those scoring 101 and less and satisfied group of those scoring 101 and above on the job satisfaction. Chi-square test has been applied to assess the differences among the various groups.

Table 04
Status-wise Distribution of Satisfied and Dissatisfied Workers in
Private and Public Sector Industrial units

Category of Worker	Name of Sector	Satisfied	Dissatisfied	Z
Skilled	Private Sector	58 (72.5)	22 (27.5)	3.04
	Public Sector	3 (42.86)	4 (57.14)	
Semi Skilled	Private Sector	32 (51.61)	30 (48.39)	2.23
	Public Sector	7 (31.82)	15 (68.18)	
Unskilled	Private Sector	162 (58.27)	116 (41.73)	0.382
	Public Sector	5 (45.45)	6 (54.55)	

A perusal of the above table reveals that a higher percentage of skilled workers in public sector industrial units (57.14) are dissatisfied while 72.5 percent skilled workers of private sector industrial units are satisfied with their jobs, only 42.86 percent skilled workers in public sector units are satisfied. Further the trend is different with regard to semi-skilled and unskilled workers. A greater percentage of them in private sector units is satisfied but in public sector units this situation is quite different. Here, majority of the semi-skilled and unskilled workers are dissatisfied with their jobs.

Conclusion

Thus, it can be concluded that job satisfaction of the workers in the private sector is higher than that of public sector. Overall job satisfaction of the workers differs not only in terms of organizational ownership, but also, the level of workers in relation to ownership is also an important factor. Moreover, the greater security of service and a stronger union of semi-skilled and unskilled workers make them fearless, defiant and indifferent while the skilled workers may become powerless and helpless.

References

1. Prasad, L.M., Principles and Practice of Management, Sultan Chand & Sons, New Delhi, 2002, P-335
2. Mintzberg, Henry, The Structuring of Organizations : A Synthesis of the Research, Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice, Hall, 1979

